Thrivers and Strugglers: How Race, Age, and Education are Fueling an Economic Divide in America

Women’s Voices Raised

May 8, 2018

Ana H. Kent, Ph.D.
Policy Analyst, Center for Household Financial Stability
Federal Reserve Bank of St. Louis

www.stlouisfed.org/hfs

*These are my own views, and not necessarily the views of the Federal Reserve Bank of St. Louis, Federal Reserve System, or the Board of Governors
Overview

- STL Fed’s HFS
- Income and wealth inequality
- Financial (in)stability
- How do demographic factors play?
- What can be done?
Why Study Wealth?

- Assets matter for economic security and upward economic mobility in ways income does not; balance sheets reveal dimensions of financial stress and health not otherwise apparent.

- Holding assets is associated with distinct social, psychological, emotional, child well-being, health, and civic outcomes.

- “Households should be encouraged to maintain at least a small buffer of liquid savings, even if the cash in that buffer is not being used to pay down high-interest debt.” (Gallagher, 2018)
Income Inequality Overall

Share of Total Pre-Tax Income

Percent

1989  2016

Bottom 50%

15.4  13.5

Top 10%

42.3  49.9

Source: Federal Reserve Survey of Consumer Finances and authors' calculations.
Wealth Inequality Overall

Share of Total Net Worth

Percent

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Bottom 50%</th>
<th>Top 10%</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1989</td>
<td>3.0</td>
<td>66.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2016</td>
<td>1.2</td>
<td>77.1</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Inequality correlates (Kaplan, Pamuk, Lynch, Cohen, & Balfour, 1996; Wilkinson & Pickett, 2006):

- Mortality rates
- Lack of social trust
- Homicide
- Violent crime
- Poor educational outcomes
- Lower population health
- Classism

Source: Federal Reserve Survey of Consumer Finances and authors' calculations.
Widespread Financial Instability

- 51% are “asset poor” – can’t cover expenses for 3 months (SHED, 2016)
- A $400 emergency expense would prompt nearly half of all families to borrow funds, sell something, or simply not pay (SHED, 2016)
- 57% of Americans are challenged to achieve “financial health” (CFSI, 2015)
- Volatile employment schedules; 17% have schedules that vary by employer’s needs (SHED, 2016)
- 40% struggled to pay bills because income was lower than normal (SHED, 2016)
- Almost 3/4 of Americans were stressed about money (APA, 2015)
The Demographics of Wealth

- First published in 2015
  - Education
  - Race
  - Age

- Updated in 2018
  - Adds education of respondent’s parents

- Uses the Survey of Consumer Finances; considered the “gold standard” in family wealth research
Thrivers vs. Strugglers: A Growing Economic Divide

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Thrivers % of Population</th>
<th>Strugglers % of Population</th>
<th>Thrivers % of Total Wealth</th>
<th>Strugglers % of Total Wealth</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1989</td>
<td>21.1%</td>
<td>78.9%</td>
<td>44.5%</td>
<td>55.5%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2016</td>
<td>21.1%</td>
<td>78.9%</td>
<td>68.2%</td>
<td>31.8%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Survey of Consumer Finances
Changes in Median Income and Net Worth Over Time

Thousands of 2016 Dollars

Source: Federal Reserve Board, Survey of Consumer Finances.
Race and Ethnicity

Real Median Family Net Worth, by Race/Ethnicity

Thousands of 2016 Dollars

- Black: 16
- Hispanic, Any Race: 22
- Other: 100
- White, Non-Hispanic: 163

Source: Federal Reserve Board, Survey of Consumer Finances.
Race and Ethnicity Gaps Over Time

Real Median Family Net Worth, By Race/Ethnicity

Thousands of 2016 Dollars

Source: Federal Reserve Board, Survey of Consumer Finances.
Real Median Family Net Worth, by Age

Thousands of 2016 Dollars

Source: Federal Reserve Board, Survey of Consumer Finances.
Age Over Time

Real Median Family Net Worth, Age/Year of Birth
Thousands of 2016 Dollars

Source: Federal Reserve Board, Survey of Consumer Finances.
Education

Real Median Family Net Worth, by Education

Thousands of 2016 Dollars

Source: Federal Reserve Board, Survey of Consumer Finances.
Education Over Time

Real Median Family Net Worth, by Educational Attainment

Thousands of 2016 Dollars

- Red: Graduate Degree
- Blue: 4-Year Degree
- Green: Some College
- Black: HS Diploma
- Orange: GED or No Diploma

Source: Federal Reserve Board, Survey of Consumer Finances.
Median Family Net Worth, by Parental Education
Thousands of 2016 Dollars

- No College: $87,000
- One College: $131,000
- Both College: $162,000
What About Combined? DoW I

Figure 6. Median Middle-Aged Family Net Worth by Inherited Characteristics and Own Education

[Diagram showing the median middle-aged family net worth by inherited characteristics and own education, with details on expected net worth based on inherited demographics and own education, and percentile increases or decreases from addition of own education.]
The Head Start effect: Families with “favorable” (white, middle-aged or older, college grad parents) inherited traits typically earn higher incomes and accumulate more wealth than families without them.

The Upward Mobility effect: Among families with less “favorable” traits, a college degree usually boosts income and wealth far above levels achieved without a degree.

The Downward Mobility effect: Families with college-educated parents who fail to also earn a degree are likely to slip notably downward in expected ranking.
WHAT ABOUT OTHER DEMOGRAPHICS?*
Social Support – Being Married or Partnered

Percent within Income Category

Source: SHED 2016
Financial Fragility by Demographics

Source: SHED 2016
Gender Wealth Gap
(Value in Median Net Worth; Source: Mariko Chang, 2015)

Single Females and Single Males

- Single Females: $3,210
- Single Males: $10,150

Single Men vs. Women, by Education

- No H.S.: $21
- High School: $500
- College: $3,000
- Grad/Prof: $109,500

Women: $18,710, $31,400, $58,120
Men: $500, $3,000, $109,500
CONCLUSIONS AND SOLUTIONS
Is Demography Economic Destiny?

No, but….

• Demographics are strongly correlated with financial outcomes

• How can we assign greater weight to demographic factors in targeting consumer protections and public and private resources?

• How can we compensate for stronger “headwinds” faced by struggling families?

• How can we promote the upward-mobility effect and compensate for the head-start effect?
1. Promote Stability, *Then* Mobility:

- 92% of Americans would choose stability over mobility (Pew, 2014)

- Help families build a rainy day fund
  - Cash beats paying debt (Gallagher, 2018)

- The balance sheets of struggling families share three characteristics:
  1. Too little savings/liquidity
  2. Too much wealth in homeownership
  3. Too much debt

- Liquid assets (even if <$2000), related to:
  - Fewer missed payments
  - Less foregone medical care
  - Greater food security

- Of all the factors examined, disparities in financial well-being are greatest between subgroups that have different levels of liquid savings (CFPB, 2017)
2. Recognize the Inequality

“If you work hard, if you believe in yourself, if you believe in America, then you can dream anything, you can be anything, and together, we can achieve anything.” – Trump, 2018

“If you work hard, if you’re willing to meet your responsibilities, you can get ahead. You can get ahead. Doesn’t matter what you look like, doesn’t matter where you come from.” – Obama, 2013

“In the United States, inequality remains for many respondents a sign of future opportunities and mobility, even though the data on mobility rates no longer support that perception.” – Graham, 2010
Investments that Promote Upward Mobility

1. Reduce racial segregation.

2. Reduce economic inequality and segregation.

3. Invest in schools – especially in teachers, principals, and efforts to get first-gen kids to and through college.

4. Improve social capital, networks and relationships.

5. Stabilize families, and reduce the incidence of single-parent households.
3. Invest in Early Childhood Environments and Assets

**Early Environments**
- Black-White reading and math test score gaps increase every year (Fryer & Levitt, 2004)
- The earlier the better! The earlier a child...
  - is read to
  - receives good nutrition
  - faces less toxic stress
  - attends an early-education program
  - is exposed to a good neighborhood
  - attends a high-performing school
  - is raised by two parents, and
  - has assets in the home

...the more educationally and financially successful that child will turn out as an adult.

**Early Assets/CDAs**
- Can address age, race, and education disparities, and promote financial inclusion
- Typically established at birth or when a child enters kindergarten
- Universal (for all kids) and progressive (more for the poor)
- Over 80% of programs use 529s
- Positive impacts on child development:
  - Maternal mental health
  - Educational expectations
  - Child development
Symposium, May 23-24, St. Louis Fed

Is College Still Worth It? Looking Back and Looking Ahead
→ How Has Education Impacted Wealth Across Generations?

https://www.stlouisfed.org/events/2018/05/hfs-collegeed0518
Thank You!

Contact Information:
Ana Hernández Kent
ana.kent@stls.frb.org

Questions?