Sovereign Debt: A Modern Greek Tragedy

Dr. Christopher Waller
Senior Vice President and Director of Research
Federal Reserve Bank of St. Louis

Any opinions expressed here are my own and do not necessarily reflect those of the Federal Open Market Committee participants.
Out of the Frying Pan, Into the Fire

- For the second time in five years, the world faces a major financial crisis.
- The 2007-08 crisis was driven by excessive mortgage debt owed by households.
- The current crisis is driven by excessive government debt owed by entire countries.
- A key factor in both crises is the fear that debts will not be repaid.
Key Questions

- Why do governments borrow?
- When does the level of debt become a burden?
- What happens if a nation defaults on its debt?
- How did Europe get in trouble and can it get out?
- Is the U.S. in trouble because of its debt?
Debt Defined

- Governments must borrow to finance shortfalls in tax revenues.

- The current shortfall is called the deficit.

- If tax revenues exceed spending, a surplus occurs.

- The national debt is the sum of the current and all past deficits/surpluses.
The Function of National Debt

- Nations borrow to finance wars, civil works, and other public services.
- Could raise taxes temporarily to pay for it.
- Better idea – borrow funds now and slowly repay the debt over time with permanently higher taxes.
- Similar to a mortgage—borrow a lot of money to buy a house now and slowly pay it off over time.
Deficit/Surplus Spending – 1791-2011

Wars are expensive endeavors

% of GDP

-35% -30% -25% -20% -15% -10% -5% 0% 5% 10%


War of 1812
Civil War
WW I
WW II
Federal Debt Held by the Public 1791-2011

Federal debt peaked in the 1940s

% of GDP

The Burden of National Debt

- Measuring the burden of the national debt is hard.

- Economists look at the debt-to-GDP ratio.

- It measures the ability to pay off the entire debt with one year’s income and ignores the wealth of the nation.

- This is a conservative measure of debt burden.

- Some have argued a ratio over 90% is cause for concern.
Rolling Over Debt

- In normal times, most nations **roll over** their debt when it’s due.

- Rolling over the debt means paying off old debt by issuing new debt.

- Lenders must be willing to do so! **Rollover risk.**

- The interest rate paid depends on the **term to maturity.**
Yield Curve

Positive relationship between yield and time to maturity
The Allure of Short-Term Debt

- Governments issue short-term debt to take advantage of lower interest rates.

- But roll over is more frequent, hence more rollover risk!

- Investors may believe a government cannot meet its debt obligations.

- So they stop rolling over debt or charge a high interest rate to do so.
Debt Default

- The debt burden of a nation is not always a good predictor of default.

- Brazil and Mexico defaulted in the early 1980s with debt-to-GDP ratios around 50%.

- Japan’s current debt-to-GDP ratio is over 200%!

- This shows that it is the nation’s perceived willingness to repay its debt that matters.
Penalties of a Debt Default

- First default: 4th century BC Greece (oh, the irony), 10 of 13 municipalities defaulted on loans from Delos Temple.

- Capital markets close off to the defaulting country.

- Cost of future finance increases.

- Reduction in output growth.
Debt Default

- While defaulting on sovereign debt is not new, it hasn’t occurred in a developed country since 1946!

- This is why the current financial crisis in Europe is of great concern.

- But European countries have had high debt-to-GDP ratios for decades.

- So why has this crisis surfaced now?
The Creation of the European Union

- After WWII, Europe vowed to never have another war fought on European soil.

- Since the early 1950s, they have steadily moved toward the creation of a “United States of Europe”.

- This included the goal of a single currency – a monetary union.

- However, fiscal union was never a serious goal.
Maastricht Treaty and the Birth of the Euro

- **Long-Term Interest Rate**: Must be within 2 percentage points of the average of the three lowest-inflation EU members.

- **Inflation**: Within 1.5 percentage points of the average of the three best-performing EU members.

- **Exchange Rate**: Applicant countries must have been in the exchange-rate mechanism (ERM) for two consecutive years and without having devalued its currency.
1997 Stability & Growth Pact

- **Deficit:** The deficit-to-GDP ratio must not exceed 3% at the end of the preceding fiscal year.

- **Debt:** The debt-to-GDP ratio must not exceed 60% at the end of the preceding fiscal year.
Markets begin to view all EU sovereign debt as identical
A Major Issue with the EU

- A concern in the 1990s was how to handle secession or ouster of a country from the EU/EMU.

- Many argued that the Maastricht Treaty needed to lay out contingency plans for such an event.

- For political reasons, this was not even broached.

- Can’t talk about divorce on wedding night!
Shaky Greek Entry into the EMU


- Greece was denied entry in 1998 because of:
  1. High inflation (5.4%)  
  2. Large budget deficits (around 6.0% of GDP)  
  3. High long-term interest rate (9.9%)  
  4. It did not participate in the ERM.

- In 2000, Greece’s deficit-to-GDP ratio was 3.7% and debt-to-GDP ratio was a whopping 103%. 
After joining the EMU, Greece paid the same interest on its debt as Germany, despite its weak fiscal condition.

In the summer of 2009, a new Greek government took power.

At the time, the Greek government claimed that Greece’s deficit-to-GDP ratio was just under 4%.

In reality, it was nearly 16%!
The Great Shocks

- Meanwhile, Ireland incurred the cost of bailing out its banking system during the 2008 crisis.

- In 2007, Ireland’s debt-to-GDP ratio was just 25% and its deficit was zero.

- By 2010, Ireland’s debt-to-GDP ratio was almost 100%, and its deficit-to-GDP ratio was over 30%!

- These shocks woke up the financial markets to the risk of default on sovereign debt.
Debt-to-GDP Ratios 2000-2011

Ratios become alarmingly high

% of GDP

Portugal  Spain  Ireland  Italy  Greece

Markets React

- Financial markets no longer view Italian, Greek, Portuguese, Irish, and Spanish debt as close substitutes for German bonds.

- Markets began hiking interest rates on sovereign debt to compensate for heightened risk of default.

- Between January 2008 and January 2012, the spreads between Greek and German debt increased **3,300 basis points!**
Default risk carries with it a hefty price.
Yield Spreads Over German 10-Yr Bonds

The Greek spread is in a league of its own

Basis Points
CDS Prices Reflect Greater Risk of Default

- Debt holders can insure themselves by purchasing Credit Default Swaps (CDS).

- CDS seller pays the value of the defaulted debt to the buyer in the event of a default.

- The price demanded by a CDS seller reflects the probability of default.

- The higher the probability of default, the higher the price charged to acquire the insurance.
CDS Prices on Sovereign 10-Year Bonds

CDS prices dramatically ramp up

Source: Bloomberg
CDS Prices on Sovereign 10-Year Bonds

CDS prices dramatically ramp up

Source: Bloomberg

Basis Points

Germany

Ireland

Jan-07  May-07  Sep-07  Jan-08  May-08  Sep-08  Jan-09  May-09  Sep-09  Jan-10  May-10  Sep-10  Jan-11  May-11  Sep-11  Jan-12

Source: Bloomberg
CDS Prices on Sovereign 10-Year Bonds

CDS prices dramatically ramp up

Source: Bloomberg
CDS Prices on Sovereign 10-Year Bonds

CDS prices dramatically ramp up

Source: Bloomberg
CDS Prices on Sovereign 10-Year Bonds

CDS prices dramatically ramp up

Basis Points

Source: Bloomberg
CDS Prices on Sovereign 10-Year Bonds

Greek CDS basically stop trading in the market

Basis Points

Source: Bloomberg
Roll Over Problem Hits the Banks

- Greek banks hold about **20%** of Greek sovereign debt (€60 billion), and the eventual Greek default dramatically weakened their balance sheets.

- Markets stopped rolling over Greek bank debt due to fears that they would no longer honor obligations.

- This in turn meant that Greek banks could not roll over funding of Greek government debt.
Austerity Measures

- Greek and Irish governments enacted unpopular austerity measures to remedy fiscal woes.

- Greece’s deficit-to-GDP ratio fell from around 16% in 2009 to a projected 9% for 2011.

- Ireland’s fell from a peak 31% in 2010 to close to 10% in 2011.

- This has generated substantial social unrest.
The EU Response to the Crisis

- In May 2010, the EU and IMF provided €750 billion to ease the rollover problem for struggling countries.

- The biggest contributors were Germany (€120 billion) and France (€90 billion).

- German banks held 8% (€24 billion) of Greek debt, and French banks held about 5% (€15 billion).

- EU leaders feared that a default on Greek and Irish debt could instigate a run on their own banks.
The Fuse to the Powder Keg

- Greece, Ireland, and Portugal are small countries. Italy and Spain are the real threat!

- Italy has close to €2 trillion of debt outstanding, half of which is held externally.

- Italy needs to roll over more than €300 billion of debt in 2012, an amount greater than the entire Greek debt!

- Similarly, Spain’s debt has reached about €735 billion; €175 billion matures in less than a year!
Tough Fiscal Road Ahead

- Several difficult options: increase taxes, cut spending, or inflate away the debt (print money).

- The pain associated with these actions will fall on different groups, and that leads to political conflict.

- Political conflict means delay in getting the fiscal situation on firmer ground.

- Political conflict erodes investor confidence.
The EU Takes Further Action

- It became clear in 2011 that the initial round of assistance would not be enough to support Italian and Spanish debt.

- An extra €340 billion was provided by the EU.

- In December 2011, the ECB poured €1 trillion of liquidity into the banking system.

- This calmed things down until very recently.
In March 2012, 80% of Greece’s private creditors agreed to a bond swap. This debt restructuring will reduce obligations by €100 billion. The Greeks effectively defaulted on half of their debt. CDS were triggered after some private creditors were forced into the debt restructuring.
The U.S. Situation

- U.S. total deficit spending went from 1.2% of GDP in 2007 to 8.7% in 2011.

- Federal debt will go from 68% of GDP in 2011 to a projected peak of 76% in 2013.

- **Gross** U.S. debt has surpassed 90%!

- These deficits are the result of lower tax revenue and higher outlays.
Flight to Quality

- Despite the large increase in U.S. debt and deficit spending, U.S. bond yields have remained near record lows.

- As investors moved away from troubled private asset markets (e.g. mortgages) and risky sovereign debt, the demand for U.S. treasuries has soared.

- This is not a reason to be at ease – the U.S. fiscal situation carries with it significant risk.
The Moral of this Tragedy

- The ability to borrow to finance current spending can be very beneficial.

- We have many examples of this:
  - WWII
  - Interstate Highway System
  - New Deal
The Moral of this Tragedy

- However, borrowing is **seductive** – the rewards are felt immediately and the pain is postponed to the future.

- It is very tempting to borrow for short-term gains while downplaying the pain to come.

- As a result, debt burdens can rise to unsustainable levels, leading to crisis and austerity.

- This is the tragedy of sovereign debt.